

Pesah: I Saw You in Egypt?

Rabbi Joshua Rabin, Astoria Center of Israel, Astoria, New York¹

Haggadah Text	
בְּכָל־דּוֹר וָדוֹר חַיִּיב אָדָם לִרְאוֹת אֶת־עַצְמוֹ כְּאִלּוּ הוּא יָצָא מִמִּצְרַיִם, שְׁנֵאֲמַר: וְהִגַּדְתָּ לְבִנְךָ בַּיּוֹם הַהוּא לֵאמֹר, בַּעֲבוּר זֶה עָשָׂה יי' לִי בְּיָצְאִי מִמִּצְרַיִם.	In every generation, each person must see himself as if he himself had come out of Egypt, as it is said: "And you shall tell your child on that day, 'Because of this the LORD acted for me when I came out of Egypt.'"

1. Conventional Connection

Maaseh Nissim on the Pesah Haggadah, "Rabban Gamliel's Three Things"	
בְּכָל דּוֹר וָדוֹר. אֵין הַכּוֹנֵה שְׁחִיב לִרְאוֹת עַצְמוֹ כְּאִלּוּ הוּא יָצָא מִמִּצְרַיִם מְשׁוּם שְׁאֵם לֹא הוֹצִיא אֲבוֹתֵינוּ גַּם אֲנַחְנוּ הֵיינוּ מְשׁוּעָדִים לְפָרְעָה דא"כ יֵאמַר בְּכָל הַנְּסִים שְׁנַעֲשׂוּ לְאֲבוֹתֵינוּ שְׁחִיב לִרְאוֹת עַצְמוֹ כְּאִלּוּ הֵינִס נַעֲשֶׂה לוֹ כְּגוֹן בְּנֵס שֶׁל אַחַשְׁוֶרוֹשׁ שְׁנִגְזַר עַל כָּל יִשְׂרָאֵל לְמִיתָה וְאֵם ח"ו הִיָּה מִתְקִים גְּזָרְנוּ אֲנוּ לֹא בָּאנוּ לְעוֹלָם וְכֵן בְּכָל הַנְּסִים שְׁנַעֲשׂוּ לְאֲבוֹת יְהִיָּה הַבְּנִים מְחִיבִים לְבָרֵךְ עַל הַנֶּסֶב שְׁנַעֲשֶׂה לוֹ וּבְהִדְיָא אֲמַרְוּ בִּשְׁ"ס בְּרֻכּוֹת שֶׁמְבָרֵךְ שַׁעֲשֶׂה נֵס לְאֲבוֹתֵינוּ וְכֵאן מְבָרֵכִין אֲשֶׁר גָּאֲלָנוּ וְגָאֵל אֶת אֲבוֹתֵינוּ וּמִזְכִּיר בְּבִרְכָּה גַּם גָּאֵלֵת עַצְמוֹ מִשָּׂא"כ בְּכָל הַנְּסִים. לָכֵן נִרְאֶה דוּדָאִי אִם הֵיינוּ עוֹשִׂין עֵקֶר שְׁמִיחָה עַל הֵינִס מָה שְׁיִצְאָנוּ מִהַמִּרְיוֹת שֶׁל שַׁעֲבֹד הַגְּלוּת לֹא הֵיינוּ מְזִכְרִין עַצְמָנוּ בְּהַבְּרָכָה וּבְהֵנִס כָּלִל כִּיֹּן שְׁאֲנַחְנוּ לֹא יִצְאָנוּ מִהַמִּרְיוֹת רַק מִפְּנֵי עֲשׂוּתֵינוּ עֵקֶר הֵינִס בִּיציאת מצרים הגאולה שהוא מָה שְׁנִקְנִינוּ לַעֲבָדִים לוֹ יִתְבָּרַךְ וְהַכְּנִסְנוּ לְקִדְשָׁתוֹ וְהַנְּחִילָנוּ קִדְשָׁת אֶרֶץ הָעֲלִיוֹנָה וְתַחְתּוֹנָה וּבְזֶה אֲנַחְנוּ וְעַם הַיּוֹצֵאִים שׁוּיִם. וְלָזֶה מְבָרֵכִין אֲשֶׁר גָּאֲלָנוּ וְגָאֵל אֲבוֹתֵינוּ שֶׁהַגָּאֵלָה הוּא עֵבֶן הַקֶּנֶן וְכַמִּשְׁל"ל וְלֹא מְבָרֵכִין אֲשֶׁר הוֹצֵאָנוּ וְהוֹצִיא אֶת אֲבוֹתֵינוּ כִּי בְּגוֹף הַיִּצִּיָּאָה אֵין לָנוּ שׁוּי עִמָּהֶם רַק בְּהַגָּאֵלָה וְמָה שְׁאֲמַר כָּאן (שְׁחִיב לִרְאוֹת עַצְמוֹ	"In every generation" – The intention is not that a person must see themselves as if they personally left Egypt simply because if our ancestors had not been redeemed, we too would still be enslaved to Pharaoh. Otherwise, one would be required to say the same for all miracles performed for our ancestors—that one must see themselves as if the miracle had been performed for them. For example, in the miracle of Achashverosh, when all of Israel was sentenced to death, had the decree been carried out, we would not have come into existence. The same logic would apply to all miracles performed for our ancestors, and their descendants would then be obligated to bless for those miracles as if they had personally experienced them. However, the Talmud in Berakhot explicitly states that when blessing for a miracle, one says, 'Who performed a miracle for our ancestors,' whereas in the blessing of the Seder night, we say, 'Who redeemed us and our ancestors,' explicitly including ourselves in the redemption— something that is not said for other miracles. Thus, it seems clear that if our primary joy were solely in the miracle of being freed from the bitterness of slavery, we would not mention ourselves in the blessing at all, since we did not personally experience that suffering. But because the primary focus of the miracle of the Exodus is the redemption, meaning that we were acquired as servants to the Blessed One, brought into His holiness, and given the sanctity of both the higher and lower lands, we are therefore equal to those who actually left Egypt. That is why we bless 'Who redeemed us and our ancestors,' because redemption signifies acquisition (by God), as explained earlier. We do not say, 'Who took us

¹ All translations are from Sefaria, unless otherwise noted.

<p>כָּאֵלּוּ הוּא יֵצֵא) הֵיִינוּ כִּיּוֹן שֶׁעָקַר הַשְּׂמֻחָה הַגָּאֻלָּה שֶׁהוּא הַקִּנְיָן שֶׁנַּעֲשֶׂה מַחְמַת הַיֵּצִיָּא וּבְנֵס הַגָּאֻלָּה כָּלֵנוּ שׂוֹיִן שֶׁשְּׂמֻחַת הַיֵּצִיָּא שְׁוֶה לָנוּ וְלָדוֹר הַיּוֹצֵאִים כִּיּוֹן שֶׁעָקַר הַשְּׂמֻחָה הַגָּאֻלָּה שֶׁהוּא הַקִּנְיָן שֶׁנַּעֲשֶׂה מַחְמַת הַיֵּצִיָּא וּבְנֵס הַגָּאֻלָּה כָּלֵנוּ שׂוֹיִן שֶׁשְּׂמֻחַת הַיֵּצִיָּא שְׁוֶה לָנוּ וְלָדוֹר הַיּוֹצֵאִים כִּיּוֹן שֶׁעָקַר הַשְּׂמֻחָה הוּא בְּהַגָּאֻלָּה בְּמָה שֶׁכָּלֵנוּ שׂוֹיִן בּוֹ גַּם כִּי הַיֵּצִיָּא הִיא סִבַּת כָּל הַנִּסִּים שֶׁעוֹשֶׂה עִמָּנוּ. וְלָזֶה מְבִיא רֵאִיָּה מִקְרָא (שֶׁנֶּאֱמַר בּוֹ) וְאוֹתָנוּ הוֹצִיא מִשָּׁם לְמַעַן הִבִּיא אֹתָנוּ) הִרִי שֶׁמִּשְׁתַּף גַּם אוֹתָנוּ בְּנֵס הַיֵּצִיָּא כִּיּוֹן שֶׁעָקַר הַתְּכֵלִית הִיָּה בְּהַיֵּצִיָּא לָתֵת לָנוּ קִדְשַׁת הָאָרֶץ.</p>	<p>out and our ancestors,' because regarding the physical act of leaving Egypt, we are not equal to them—only in the redemption itself. So when it says here that 'one must see themselves as if they had left,' it means that since the primary joy is in the redemption, which is the acquisition that resulted from the Exodus, and in this miracle of redemption we are all equal, the joy of the Exodus applies to us just as it did to that generation. Since the essential joy is in the redemption, in which we are all equal, and since the Exodus was the foundation for all the miracles God continues to perform for us, we too are included in it. This is why the verse states, 'And He took us out from there so that He might bring us'—showing that we, too, are included in the miracle of the Exodus, because the ultimate purpose of leaving Egypt was to bring us into the sanctity of the Land."</p>
--	--

2. Our Inner Egypt

Sefat Emet, Pesah 2:1 (5631/1871)	
<p>בְּכָל דּוֹר וְדוֹר חַיִּב אָדָם לִרְאוֹת אֶת עַצְמוֹ כּו' וְאִח"כ אָמַר וְאוֹתָנוּ הוֹצִיא. וְנִרְאֶה כִּי ע"י אֱמוּנָה שְׂיִש יֵצִיאת מִצְרַיִם לְכָל דּוֹר וְדוֹר נִתְגַּלָּה זֶה. וּמִהֲר"ל כָּתֵב כִּי בְּכָלֵל הִי' כָּל אֶחָד בִּיֵּצִיאת מִצְרַיִם רַק חַיִּב לִרְאוֹת כָּאֵלּוּ יֵצֵא בִּפְרָט ע"ש... וְכֵן הִפִּי' בִּסְפּוֹר יֵצִיאת מִצְרַיִם אֶפְלוּ כָּלֵנוּ חֻכְמִים כּו'. כִּי אִף שֶׁהוּא חֻכֵּם דְּבוּק בֶּה' חַיִּים יֵשׁ לוֹ לִדַּע כִּי כָּל זֶה ע"י יצ"מ שֶׁהֶאֱמַת כֵּן רַק שֶׁצָּרִיךְ לִבְרֹר זֶה ע"י אֱמוּנָה וְהוּא הַסְפּוֹר לְשׁוֹן בְּרוּר וְגִלּוֹי מִפְּרָשֶׁת כִּי בְּכָל דּוֹר יֵשׁ יֵצִיאת מִצְרַיִם לְפִי עֵינֵי הַדּוֹר וּכ"ז הִי' בְּשִׁעַת יֵצִיאת מִצְרַיִם. וְכִפִּי אֱמוּנַת הָאָדָם כָּאֵלּוּ יֵצֵא נִתְגַּלָּה בְּחִי' זוֹ וּמִרְגִּישׁ מִיֵּצֵא מִשָּׁל עֵתָה וְיוֹכֵל לִצְאָת כָּל אֶחָד מִמֵּצַר שָׁלוֹ:</p>	<p>"In every generation, a person is obligated to see themselves..."—And afterward, it is written, 'And He took us out.' It seems that through faith in the concept that the Exodus from Egypt happens in every generation, this idea is revealed. The Maharal wrote that every individual was included in the Exodus from Egypt, but one is obligated to perceive it as if they personally left... This also explains the statement regarding recounting the Exodus, 'Even if we were all wise...'—For even a wise person who is deeply connected to God must know that all of their spiritual life stems from the Exodus. This is the absolute truth, but one must clarify this through faith, and that is the purpose of storytelling (sippur)—a language of clarification and explicit revelation. For in every generation, there is an aspect of the Exodus according to the needs of that generation, and all of it was already included in the original Exodus. According to a person's level of faith in perceiving themselves as if they left, this truth is revealed in their life, and they can experience their own personal redemption. Every person can emerge from their own personal constraints (Mitzrayim, which also means 'narrow places').</p>

3. I Saw You in Egypt?

Yuval Noah Harari, <i>Nexus: A Brief History of Information Networks from the Stone Age to AI</i> , 23-24	
<p>...in the most important celebration of the Jewish calendar, millions of Jews put on a show that they remember things that they didn't witness and that probably never happened at all. As numerous modern studies indicate, repeatedly retelling a fake memory eventually causes the person to adopt it as a genuine recollection. When two Jews encounter each other for the first time, they can immediately feel that they both belong to the same family... That's a powerful bond that has sustained the Jewish network over many centuries and continents.</p>	
Big Question: Which of these explanations appeals to you the most? The least?	