

## Parashat Bemidbar: Holy People are Still People

Rabbi Joshua Rabin, Astoria Center of Israel, Astoria, New York<sup>1</sup>

| Bemidbar 1:51                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>וּבְנֹכַח הַמִּשְׁכָּן יִרְדּוּ הַלְוִיִּם וּבְחֹנֶת הַמִּשְׁכָּן יִקְיֵמוּ<br/>אֶתֹ הַלְוִיִּם וְהֶזַר הַקָּרֵב יוּמָת:</p> | <p>When the Tabernacle is to set out, the Levites shall take it down, and when the Tabernacle is to be pitched, the Levites shall set it up; any outsider who encroaches shall be put to death.</p> |

### 1. Rabbi Akiva Laughs

| Bavli Makkot 24b                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>שׁוּב פַּעַם אַחַת הָיוּ עוֹלִין לִירוּשָׁלַיִם, כִּיּוֹן שֶׁהִגִּיעוּ לָהֶר<br/>הַצּוֹפִים קָרְעוּ בְּגָדֵיהֶם, כִּיּוֹן שֶׁהִגִּיעוּ לָהֶר הַבֵּית רָאוּ<br/>שׁוֹעַל שֶׁיֵּצֵא מִבֵּית קֹדֶשׁ הַקָּדָשִׁים, הִתְחִילוּ הֵן בּוֹכִין<br/>וְרַבִּי עֲקִיבָא מַצְחֵק. אָמְרוּ לוֹ: מִפְּנֵי מָה אַתָּה מַצְחֵק?<br/>אָמַר לָהֶם: מִפְּנֵי מָה אַתֶּם בּוֹכִים? אָמְרוּ לוֹ: מִקּוֹם<br/>שֶׁכְּתוּב בּוֹ "וְהֶזַר הַקָּרֵב יוּמָת", וְעַכְשֵׁי שׁוֹעֲלִים הֵלְכוּ<br/>בּוֹ, וְלֹא נִבְּקָה!?</p> | <p>On another occasion they were ascending to Jerusalem after the destruction of the Temple. When they arrived at Mount Scopus and saw the site of the Temple, they rent their garments in mourning, in keeping with halakhic practice. When they arrived at the Temple Mount, they saw a fox that emerged from the site of the Holy of Holies. They began weeping, and Rabbi Akiva was laughing. They said to him: For what reason are you laughing? Rabbi Akiva said to them: For what reason are you weeping? They said to him: This is the place concerning which it is written: "And the non-priest who approaches shall die" (Numbers 1:51), and now foxes walk in it; and shall we not weep?</p> |
| <p>אָמַר לָהֶן: לָכֵן אֲנִי מַצְחֵק, דְּכָתִיב: "וְאֶעֱיֵדָה לִי עֲדִים<br/>נְאֻמִּים אֶת אֹרֵיָה הַכֹּהֵן וְאֶת זְכַרְיָה בֶן יִבְרָכְיָהוּ" – וְכִי<br/>מָה עֲנִין אֹרֵיָה אֶצֶל זְכַרְיָה? אֹרֵיָה בְּמִקְדָּשׁ רִאשׁוֹן,<br/>וְזְכַרְיָה בְּמִקְדָּשׁ שֵׁנִי! אֲלָא: תֵּלָה הַפְּתוּב נְבֻאָתוֹ שֶׁל<br/>זְכַרְיָה בְּנְבֻאָתוֹ שֶׁל אֹרֵיָה.</p>                                                                                                                                             | <p>Rabbi Akiva said to them: That is why I am laughing, as it is written, when God revealed the future to the prophet Isaiah: "And I will take to Me faithful witnesses to attest: Uriah the priest, and Zechariah the son of Jeberechiah" (Isaiah 8:2). Now what is the connection between Uriah and Zechariah? He clarifies the difficulty: Uriah prophesied during the First Temple period, and Zechariah prophesied during the Second Temple period, as he was among those who returned to Zion from Babylonia. Rather, the verse established that fulfillment of the prophecy of Zechariah is dependent on fulfillment of the prophecy of Uriah.</p>                                               |
| <p>בְּאֹרֵיָה כָּתִיב "לֵכֵן בְּגִלְלֶכֶם צִיּוֹן שְׂדֵה תַחְרֹשׁ", בְּזְכַרְיָה<br/>כָּתִיב "עוֹד יֵשְׁבוּ זִקְנִים וְזִקְנוֹת בְּרַחֲבוֹת יְרוּשָׁלַם". עַד<br/>שֶׁלֹא נִתְקַיְּמָה נְבֻאָתוֹ שֶׁל אֹרֵיָה הֵייתִי מִתְיַרָא שֶׁלֹא<br/>נִתְקַיְּמָה נְבֻאָתוֹ שֶׁל זְכַרְיָה, עַכְשֵׁי שֶׁנִּתְקַיְּמָה נְבֻאָתוֹ</p>                                                                                                                                                                          | <p>In the prophecy of Uriah it is written: "Therefore, for your sake Zion shall be plowed as a field, and Jerusalem shall become rubble, and the Temple Mount as the high places of a forest" (Micah 3:12), where foxes are found. There is a rabbinic tradition that this was prophesied by Uriah. In the prophecy of Zechariah</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |

<sup>1</sup> All translations are from Sefaria, unless otherwise noted.

|                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>שֶׁל אוּרִיָּה – בִּידוּעַ שְׁנוּבָאָתוֹ שֶׁל זְכַרְיָה מִתְקַיֵּמַת.<br/>בְּלִשְׁוֹן הַזֶּה אָמְרוּ לוֹ: עֲקִיבָא נִחְמָתְנוּ, עֲקִיבָא נִחְמָתְנוּ.</p> | <p>it is written: “There shall yet be elderly men and elderly women sitting in the streets of Jerusalem” (Zechariah 8:4). <b>Until the prophecy of Uriah with regard to the destruction of the city was fulfilled I was afraid that the prophecy of Zechariah would not be fulfilled</b>, as the two prophecies are linked. <b>Now that the prophecy of Uriah was fulfilled, it is evident that the prophecy of Zechariah remains valid.</b> The Gemara adds: The Sages <b>said to him</b>, employing this formulation: <b>Akiva, you have comforted us; Akiva, you have comforted us.</b></p> |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|

## 2. Resurrection of the Dead

| Zekhariah 8:4-5                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>כֹּה אָמַר יְהוָה צְבָאוֹת עַד יֵשְׁבוּ זָקְנִים וְזָקֻנוֹת בִּרְחוֹבוֹת יְרוּשָׁלַם וְאִישׁ מִשְׁעֲנֵתוֹ בִּידוֹ מִרְבַּ יָּמִים: וְרַחְבּוֹת הָעִיר יִמְלְאוּ יְלָדִים וְיִלְדוֹת מִשְׁחָקִים בִּרְחוֹבֶיהָ:</p> | <p>Thus said God of Hosts: There shall yet be elderly men and women in the squares of Jerusalem, each with staff in hand because of their great age. And the squares of the city shall be crowded with boys and girls playing in the squares.</p> |

| Bavli Pesahim 68a                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>אָמַר רַבִּי שְׁמוּאֵל בַּר נַחֲמָנִי אָמַר רַבִּי יוֹנָתָן: עֲתִידִים צְדִיקִים שְׂיַחֲיוּ מֵתִים, שְׁנֶאֱמַר: “עוֹד יֵשְׁבוּ זָקְנִים וְזָקֻנוֹת בִּרְחוֹבוֹת יְרוּשָׁלַם וְאִישׁ מִשְׁעֲנֵתוֹ בִּידוֹ מִרְבַּ יָּמִים”, וְכָתִיב: “וְשַׁמֶּת מִשְׁעֲנֵתִי עַל פְּנֵי הַנֶּעֱר.”</p> | <p>Rabbi Shmuel bar Nahmani said that Rabbi Yonatan said: <b>In the future the righteous will resurrect the dead, as it is stated: “Old men and old women shall yet again dwell in the streets of Jerusalem, and every man with his staff in his hand for very age” (Zechariah 8:4). And the staff will then be used as it was used by Gehazi when Elisha sent him to bring the son of the Shunamite woman back to life, as it is written: “And you shall lay my staff on the face of the child” (II Kings 4:29).</b></p> |

| Tosafot on Makkot 24b                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>וּא"כ ע"כ הָאֵי נְבוּאָה לְעִתִּיד לְבֹא שְׁהֲרִי עֶבֶר בֵּית ראשון וּבֵית שְׁנִי שֶׁלֹּא הִיְתָה תְּחִילַת הַמֵּתִים וְנִיחָא הַכֹּל וְהַשֵּׁם יִזְכְּנוּ לְרִאוֹת מְשִׁיחַ אֲמֵן:</p> | <p>If so, we are compelled to say that this prophecy is about the future (after the resurrection), for both the First and Second Temples have passed, and there was no resurrection during those times. Therefore, everything fits well. May God merit us to see the Messiah, Amen.</p> |

## 3. Holy People Are Still People

| Jacob Neusner, “Varieties of Judaism in the Formative Age,” in <i>Jewish Spirituality</i> , ed. Arthur Green, 173                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |  |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| <p>The rabbi shared knowledge of revelation that God had given to Moses: that made him a holy person; it did not mean he was no longer a person. What made the rabbi different from other supernatural figures in antiquity was his aspiration <i>not</i> to be different from other Jews... True, the rabbi was different from other Jews. But... the rabbi's deepest aspiration was that Jews be like them, so that they would not be different at all.</p> |  |
| <p><b>Big Question: How is the rabbinic idea of the resurrection of the dead a more democratizing Jewish idea than what came before it?</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |  |